



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

azo dyes could only be obtained in yellows or oranges, but Caro's discovery of 'fast red' in 1879 effectually disposed of these imaginary limitations, and from that date onwards every year saw the production of new azo-dyes of all shades and colors; one dye in particular deserves notice, namely Biebrich scarlet, discovered by Nietzki in 1879 as being the first representative of the sub-class known as disazo dyes, which have since grown to be of very great importance." Prof. F. Womack gives a classification and discussion of instrumental aids for deafness. The number concludes with essay-reviews; accounts of recent advances in science: mathematics, astronomy, physics, chemistry, geology, botany, zoology and anthropology; and notes, correspondence, and reviews of books. Φ

---

#### BOOK REVIEWS AND NOTES.

THE FIRST GRAMMAR OF THE LANGUAGE SPOKEN BY THE BONTOC IGOROT. With a Vocabulary, Texts, etc. By *Carl Wilhelm Seidenadel*. Chicago: The Open Court Pub. Co., 1909. Price, \$5.00 net.

This sumptuous volume bears *prima facie* evidence of devotion and affection. The author is evidently in love with his subject, and the contributors who made the publication possible must have caught something of his enthusiasm, to send forth his work, gowned in silk and gold, with gilt top, printed at least in part with specially-cast type, its typography and illustrations superb, and its dimensions reminding one of the Family Bible which posed on the center-table of most New England houses of the past generation.

One pauses to wonder, Why all this sumptuousness? Certainly there is no eager race in and around Bontok to learn the local dialect. One can count on one hand the number of white people who have made any serious effort at all to do this, including Dr. Seidenadel, and still have fingers left. But doubtless there is a circle, of which not the center, and hardly the circumference, touches Bontok, of those whose interest in the subject is nevertheless real; we mean the scholars of the "MP" (Malayo-Polynesian) languages. Here is a field just opening more widely, and here is a scattered group of specialists that must be duly impressed and edified. There is a specific gravity in tomes, and we predict that this luxurious volume will take high rank as a heavy-weight.

And this not only as to appearance, but also as to contents. May I be pardoned for suggesting incidentally, just here, that, for gaining this prestige, the rather general discrediting of every effort which others have made in the same field was hardly necessary or effective, and that the innuendoes indulged in seem somewhat petty and ungenerous. The impression of accurate, painstaking scholarship loses rather than gains by their presence in the prefatory pages of the various parts of the book.

Otherwise the work is full of merit. One wonders that so much could be accomplished when he considers the method and circumscribing conditions.

Dr. Seidenadel had not the Igorots flocking around him from early sunrise till nightfall, as we have; their talk, their songs, the sound of their gongs, constantly dinning in his ears. He had to go to them at times when they could get an interval from their show-business in American pleasure resorts, and patiently gather his material from the men and boys who became his informants, teachers and helpers.

And yet while in this there was a loss, there was also a gain. The loss was that which can only be gotten in informal, habitual contact, the things which one "picks up," as a child acquires a language, not reasoning much why or how a thing is so. The pencil and note-book plan of approaching linguistic and ethnological problems has certain drawbacks. The observer thinks he has a fact, notes it down, and proceeds to ask whether it is so. He probably elicits an affirmative answer; but the chances are at least even that the thing is not so at all, or only partly so, and under certain conditions. This is emphatically true of the Bontok Igorots, and I fancy it may be of most "primitive" people. Reliance on this method has marred the value of otherwise admirable books. It is safe to say that the ultimate facts, linguistic or other, regarding the Igorot, can never be gotten at except by one who, by actual residence among the people, gleans his information informally, but has his note-book in steady use behind a screen. One can only wish that the author, with his evident love for the work, could do this.

As it is, he has made mistakes, due doubtless to this (*quasi*) exotic though necessary character of his method. Our best language-helper (we know well most of Dr. Seidenadel's helpers and have had several of them in our employ) sits down to *The First Grammar*, and, reading a rule and examples, says occasionally, "Oh that is not so, that is not right!"

For example, we take up the volume and turn, quite at random, to p. 110 and remark that *Tekuafek* should be *Tekuafak*, the -ek form not being found in this verb. On p. 113 *Alitauko* should be *Alitauk*. On p. 150 *Nan soklong ay maisabfud* means not the hat which "is suspended," but which "is to be suspended." A little lower down on the same page one can say emphatically that the Bontok people *never* say *mangayak*, but *mangayag*. This is only one of many cases, however, where Dr. Seidenadel's reproductions of sounds are simply "impossible." Under "Interrogative Sentences," p. 160, my helper strenuously objects to *Aykö tinmoli siya ay?* for "Has he returned?" "Barlig or Lias men might say it that way, but Bontok never." On p. 167 *Ngagka man ken Bugti?* is declared to be meaningless, *enisibanyu ken* being the correct expression. On p. 169 *mangaktam* is given for *mangaktanam*; and so on. All this in a cursory way, with growing wonder, not that some errors are made, but that, under the circumstances, they are so few; and that one of a different race, so far removed from the abode of the main body of the people, should be able to produce what so nearly stands the test of intelligent native criticism.

Formerly, when we had time for "systematic" note-book work, we too wrote down a good many things which were "not so"; any one will. But after all, the systematic method must be combined with the other. It is systematic, and thoughtful and definite; and definite results, even if mistaken, are good waymarks. On the whole Dr. Seidenadel seems to recognize this, in spite of some apparent assumptions of infallibility.

The author looks askance at missionaries and their language-work; they are so unscientific and take such liberties. Without claiming a right to hold a brief for all missionaries, we may perhaps say that many, even most of them, approach the subject from a very different direction from that of a Chicago University linguist. They want to *use* the language as much as their limited abilities will allow, and if, as in the case of the Bontok dialect, it has never been put down in black and white, they want to commit it to writing, and to printing, and to teach the people to read their own language. Now, as the Doctor constantly affirms, this language is full of variations, transpositions, substitutions; variations in the individual pronunciation, according as a man lives on one side or the other of this river or that mountain. This being so, the missionary's utilitarian object demands that these minor differences be levelled, and that something like a just and intelligible average be struck. In fact he enters into the field of Igorot as a disturbing factor in just the same sense that Caxton did into English. He will doubtless use all the knowledge and good sense he possesses in the task of deciding how he will write words, giving a large consideration to local and antecedent conditions; and then, although he wishes to be humble, he has to seem to arrogate to himself the position of an authority and decide and put into practice what he thinks to be the best.

It is thus that languages live and grow in the presence of civilization and competing languages; they must consolidate and unify, or they degenerate into confused jargons. The Igorot is all the time being hard-pressed by the Ilokano. An immense change has come over the language of the Bontok men who come into contact with outsiders, within the last three years. We missionaries bewail and would fain resist this, as much as the author would. It is a fact to be met, if at all, by training the teachable young to regard their mother-tongue as a dignified, respectable, regular language, not to be dropped at the approach of English or Ilokano, and which, if they will, they can read, and write, and print. If a good nucleus of such intelligent Igorots of the rising generation can be made to see this and take hold of it, the seed will have been sown, we hope, which shall develop into a force to bind language and people together.

Of course this missionary idea is different from the museum, or preserving process, beyond which the linguist, pure and simple, seems unable to think. To bottle up a language in long rows of labeled and slightly varying specimens is very interesting, and of course quite scientific; but it implies that the specimens are, after all, dead things, relics of a past development, but with no special future except for the dissector and microscopist. The two ideas are not antagonistic, unless one or the other assumes the offensive. Let the scientist use his scalpel all he will, so that he understands that he is engaged in vivisection; but let the missionary's dealing with a living race that is begetting sons and daughters that have souls, be also respected.

For the author's grammatical study and analysis of the language we have only words of admiration. Our language helper may find errors which possibly we may be able to recognize; but in general Dr. Seidenadel has gone far more deeply into the construction of the dialect than we have either the time or the ability to do.

His writing of the sounds is different from ours in many respects, and

in some instances we have been at great loss to see how he could justify his system of alphabetization and reproduction of words. One principle which has guided us, that of averages where there is variation, he, from his standpoint would wholly reject, of course. Another important factor is the racial one. His ears and tongue are German; ours are not. Here come in matters beyond dispute. And in writing for people here we have had to take into account the various contacts, Ilokano, Spanish, American.

Taken from the standpoint of the author, the work is altogether and emphatically a most valuable one. It is easily the *opus magnum* on the subject thus far, and will probably remain so until the author can come to the Islands with leisure to cultivate in the home of his friends, of whom he has many, the pursuits of which he has already reaped such noteworthy fruits.

WALTER C. CLAPP.

*Postscript.*—The foregoing review was written at Bontok, in the Philippine Islands, about a year after the appearance of the book. Early in 1912 the reviewer left the Mission on furlough, and, under a sense of duty and in spite of his affection for the Igorots, decided not to return. Dr. Seidenadel died in Chicago about a year ago. He had long cherished a desire to go to Bontok and study the people and their language there; and it is to be regretted that his patience, enthusiasm and genius are no longer available for that adventure. The tradition of language-work in the Mission, made less imperative from one standpoint by the American development of Bontok as a provincial capital, is not abandoned. Miss Margaret P. Waterman, a graduate of Wellesley College and long recognized as the best practical linguist among the residents in the matter of the Igorot dialect, has completed a study of *Bontok Stems and Their Derivatives* (Bureau of Science, Manila, 1912), and a translation of St. Luke's Gospel (British and Foreign Bible Society) and is now at work on a simple practical manual of grammar. But Dr. Seidenadel's book is likely to remain always a great help to those who pursue the ideal of cultivating the native dialect,—to say nothing of its value as a permanent contribution to the literature of philology and ethnic science.

DANVILLE, PA.

W. C. C.

---

Mr. Albert J. Edmunds of Philadelphia has prepared two postscripts (dated 1912 and 1914) to the fourth edition of his *Buddhist and Christian Gospels* (Philadelphia, 1907-1909). These contain additional notes and bibliographical references, and even sum up Mr. Edmunds's position on the subject of Buddhist-Christian loans at the present time, including an enumeration of the three phrases in the Gospels, which he regards as directly borrowed, and the five narratives colored by Buddhist influence. He has thus formulated a motto which he expects to place at the head of any future articles on the loan hypothesis:

"Both religions independent in the main, but out of eighty-nine chapters in the Gospels, the equivalent of one (mostly in Luke) is colored by a knowledge of Buddhism. The transference was made possible by recently discovered versions of the Buddhist scriptures in vernaculars of the Parthian empire. Parthians were present at the founding of the Christian religion (Acts ii. 9)."